

e-post: kaisa.svennberg@sis.se**SIS**
Remissvar
Kaisa Svennberg
118 80 STOCKHOLM

SIS/TK 189, Innemiljö och energianvändning i byggnader

Svar på SIS-remiss 5443

avseende prEN ISO 16484-5

**Senaste
svarsdatum** **2007-10-18**

Uppgifter om svarslämnaren Företag/Organisation/Myndighet Enskild person

Företag/Organisation/Myndighet

Novacon AB

Handläggare (namn, telefon)

Christer Levin, 0708-997710

Datum 2007-10-16

Remissvar

- Avstår
 - Tillstyrker utan kommentarer
 - Tillstyrker med kommentarer
 - Avstyrker med motivering
 - Har erfarenhet inom det område förslaget täcker
 - Har tillämpat förslaget
 - Ej berörd
 - Kommentarer till föreslagen svensk titel
-

Datum

2007-10-16

Svarslämnare: Novacon AB

Kommentarer på: SIS-remiss 5443

Förslag: prEN ISO 16484-5

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
ID	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comm ent	Comment (justification for changes)	Proposed chang.	Fylls i av SIS
	General 4. 6. 7. - 11. Annex A Annex H		Te, ge	<p>BACnet uses collapsed 4-layer architecture for data communication. It specifies five different communication protocols for Data Link/Physical layers. Six protocols if you include the BVLL (BACnet Virtual Link Layer) as specified in Annex J. In addition to that, there are even more options which can differ between different vendors.</p> <p>The result of the discrepancy between the interfaces means that gateways often are needed for communication.</p> <p>BACnet defines protocol implementation conformance statement (PICS), in Annex A, which defines different levels of compliance. A given vendor can be BACnet compatible and still meet a very low level of compliance.</p> <p>The use of BACnet does not sufficiently improve interoperability between vendors since the communication interfaces differ a lot.</p>	EN ISO 16484-5 (BACnet) should be rejected as standard.	
	6. Annex J		te	<p>BACnet Annex J specifies the use of BACnet in a TCP/IP network BACnet/IP. Obviously the architecture of BACnet was not easily adapted to TCP/IP.</p> <p>BACnet/IP is mainly designed to be compatible with BACnet's other communication solutions and is probably for that reason not fully adapted to the transport and network layers used by TCP/IP.</p> <p>BACnet/IP uses BACnet Virtual Link Layer which in some ways can be preserved as an emergency solution.</p> <p>It is hard to believe that a communication protocol for building automation, not fully adapted to the architecture of TCP/IP, is the right choice for the future.</p>	EN ISO 16484-5 (BACnet) should be rejected as standard.	